



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER OF PATENTS AND TRADEMARKS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/057,024	01/25/2002	Ali Afzali-Ardakani	YOR920000442US2	5068

7590

05/19/2003

Dr. Daniel P. Morris, Esq.  
IBM Corporation  
Intellectual Property Law Dept.  
P.O. Box 218  
Yorktown Heights, NY 10598

EXAMINER

LAMBKIN, DEBORAH C

ART UNIT

PAPER NUMBER

1626

DATE MAILED: 05/19/2003

4

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

*Spoke w/ att. of rec 11/20/04 = faxed may 19/03*

**Office Action Summary**

Application No.

10/057,024

Applicant(s)

AFZALI-ARDAKANI ET AL.

Examiner

Deborah C Lambkin

Art Unit

1626

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

**Period for Reply**

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).
- Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

**Status**

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 05 May 2003.
- 2a) ☐ This action is FINAL. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

**Disposition of Claims**

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-18 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) 11-18 is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-10 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☒ Claim(s) 1-18 are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

**Application Papers**

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
- Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
- 11) ☐ The proposed drawing correction filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is: a) ☐ approved b) ☐ disapproved by the Examiner.
- If approved, corrected drawings are required in reply to this Office action.
- 12) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.

**Priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 119 and 120**

- 13) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some \* c) ☐ None of:
- ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
  - ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
  - ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).
- \* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.
- 14) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e) (to a provisional application).
- a) ☐ The translation of the foreign language provisional application has been received.
- 15) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 120 and/or 121.

**Attachment(s)**

- 1) ☒ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- 3) ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449) Paper No(s) \_\_\_\_\_
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413) Paper No(s) \_\_\_\_\_
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
- 6) ☐ Other: \_\_\_\_\_

Art Unit: 1626

***Election/Restrictions***

Applicant's election without traverse of Group 1, claims 1-10, in Paper No. 3 is acknowledged.

Claims 11-18 are withdrawn from further consideration because they are drawn to non-elected subject matter.

Applicant is requested to cancel said non-elected subject matter and file a divisional thereto.

***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112***

The following is a quotation of the second paragraph of 35 U.S.C. 112:

The specification shall conclude with one or more claims particularly pointing out and distinctly claiming the subject matter which the applicant regards as his invention.

Claims 1-10 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention.

Claims 1-10 are drawn to "A structure". It is not clear what applicant means by a structure. The only mention of "a structure" in the specification is "a TFT structure". If this is what applicant is referring to, please insert the "TFT" before structure in the claims for clarity and definiteness. If the structure is not a TFT structure then applicant should explain exactly what is meant by this term and what it encompasses.

The word, "preferably" in claim 2 is impermissible claim language because it is indefinite.

The variables, n and R, in claim 1 are undefined.

***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112***

The following is a quotation of the first paragraph of 35 U.S.C. 112:

The specification shall contain a written description of the invention, and of the manner and process of making and using it, in such full, clear, concise, and exact terms as to enable any person skilled in the art to which it pertains, or with which it is most nearly connected, to make and use the same and shall set forth the best mode contemplated by the inventor of carrying out his invention.

Claims 1-3 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, first paragraph, because the specification, while being enabling for some polar functionalities, does not reasonably provide enablement for all and every polar functionality known. The specification does not enable any person skilled in the art to which it pertains, or with which it is most nearly connected, to make and use the invention commensurate in scope with these claims.

The specification lacks adequate support and enablement for all polar functionalities and only gives a few examples which is not seen how this cannot be extrapolated to all polar functionalities without reasonable evidence that all would work as claimed, especially in light of the fact that the behavior of a given chemical group in certain or particular environments are usually unpredictable. Hence, it would require undue experimentation for one of ordinary skill the art at the time the application was filed to find out which polar functionalities other than those disclosed would work as claimed. As a result, the enablement for this term is not commensurate in scope to the claims as recited.

It is suggested that applicant limit this term in Markush language to the actual polar groups contemplated such as those recited in claims 4-10.

Art Unit: 1626

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Deborah C. Lambkin whose telephone number is 703-308-4522.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Joseph McKane, can be reached on (703) 308-4537. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-308-7922.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is 703-308-1235.

DEBORAH C. LAMBKIN  
PRIMARY EXAMINER



---

Deborah C. Lambkin  
Primary Patent Examiner  
Art Unit 1626